

To: Ms. Ursula von der Leyen, President of the European Commission

Ms. Teresa Ribera, Executive Vice-President for a Clean, Just and Competitive Transition

Ms. Henna Virkkunen, Executive Vice-President for Tech Sovereignty, Security and Democracy

Date: 9 October 2025

Re: Urgent Call for a Robust and Transparent Review of the Digital Services Act, Including Reviewing Protections for Free Expression

We write amid global instability—marked by conflict, inequality, and accelerating digitalisation. Particularly in such times, the ability of citizens to freely express their views, question prevailing narratives, and engage in open public discourse is not a luxury. It is a necessity.

Freedom of expression is the cornerstone of democratic societies. It is through the exchange of ideas—including controversial ones—that societies evolve, and public officials remain accountable.

Yet across the European Union and beyond, we are witnessing a shrinking of civic space. Each week brings new reports of individuals facing censorship or punitive measures for speech that challenges prevailing orthodoxy—whether it is member of Parliament Päivi Räsänen in Finland, or veteran Adam Smith-Connor in the United Kingdom.

In an era where public discourse increasingly takes place online, the Digital Services Act (DSA) compounds these concerns. Although the Commission has claimed that the DSA enhances "legal certainty" and provides "greater democratic control", its current framework undermines free speech.

The DSA introduces sweeping mechanisms that empower both institutions and private actors to flag content they *believe* to be "illegal"—a term broadly defined as any content not compliant with EU or national laws. This creates a situation in which speech lawful at the time of publication could be retroactively flagged and penalised under shifting legal standards across 27 member states.

Let us be clear: there is a broad consensus that certain forms of expression—such as child exploitation or incitement to terrorism—must be prohibited. However, the DSA goes far beyond these narrow and universally agreed limits. Instead, it constructs a pan-European censorship

infrastructure with loosely defined boundaries and the potential to suppress legitimate democratic discourse. This raises several pressing concerns:

## 1. A Race to the Bottom in Censorship Standards

The wide definition of illegal content allows the most speech-restrictive provisions of one single EU country to be imposed as a standard across the entire Union, and potentially worldwide, effectively importing the lowest common denominator of expression

#### 2. Cross-Border Enforcement and Worldwide Takedown Orders

The broad definition of "illegal content" in the DSA, combined with existing jurisprudence of the Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU), opens the door to worldwide takedowns. For example, in the <u>Glawischnig-Piesczek</u> case, the CJEU allowed removal obligations to extend beyond national borders within the EU, while in the <u>Google LLC</u> case, it confirmed that takedowns could even have a worldwide effect.

Reflecting these concerns, the U.S. House Judiciary Committee warned in a letter to European Commissioner Henna Virkkunen that the DSA, though formally limited to EU speech, could end up curbing the constitutionally protected speech of Americans. "Though nominally applicable to only EU speech, the DSA, as written, may limit or restrict Americans' constitutionally protected speech in the United States. Companies that censor an insufficient amount of 'misleading or deceptive' speech—as defined by EU bureaucrats—face fines up to six percent of global revenue, which would amount to billions of dollars for many American companies. Furthermore, because many social media platforms generally maintain one set of content moderation policies that they apply globally, restrictive censorship laws like the DSA may set de facto global censorship standards."

# 3. Incompatibility with Freedom of Expression

The DSA risks contravening the well-established principles of freedom of expression enshrined in Article 11 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, Article 10 of the European Convention on Human Rights, and Article 19 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. These instruments require that any limitation on speech be lawful, necessary, proportionate, and foreseeable. Yet, under the DSA, content moderation decisions are increasingly governed by vague categories such as disinformation, hate speech, abuse of information, information integrity, and information manipulation, many of which lack clear legal definitions or consistent judicial interpretation.

### 4. Delegation of Censorship to Unaccountable Entities

The DSA deputizes so-called "trusted flaggers"—many of whom operate without transparency, democratic oversight, or accountability—to police online discourse. These entities may act with their own political or ideological agendas, further eroding public trust.

## 5. Opaque Review Process

We are also concerned by the Commission's ongoing implementation review. According to the <u>response</u> to an urgent Written Question in the European Parliament, the review is based on undisclosed surveys sent to unnamed stakeholders. This process lacks transparency, undermining the very democratic legitimacy the DSA claims to enhance.

In light of these concerns, and pursuant to Article 91 of the DSA—which mandates a formal review by 17 November—we, the undersigned, urge the European Commission to:

- Conduct a comprehensive and inclusive consultation with independent experts in freedom of expression, constitutional law, and digital rights, ahead of the November review, inviting public comments.
- 2. Publicly disclose the list of NGOs, civil society actors, and partner entities engaged in the review process, including the criteria and methodology used for their selection.
- 3. Ensure that the review includes a rigorous legal analysis of the DSA's compatibility with fundamental rights protections, especially under Article 11 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU, Article 10 of the ECHR, and Article 19 of the ICCPR.

The European Union has long prided itself on being a beacon of democracy, human rights, and the rule of law. But rights safeguarded in charters and treaties must also be protected in regulation and practice. Only through an honest and critical assessment can the EU ensure that its digital policies remain aligned with the very human rights principles it seeks to defend.

#### Yours sincerely,

- 1. Ayaan Hirsi Ali Research Fellow, Hoover Institution, Stanford University, Founder of the AHA Foundation
- 2. Prof. Paul D. Aligică Professor, University of Bucharest
- 3. Gilbert Andres Chairperson, Advocates for Freedom of Expression Coalition, Southeast Asia
- 4. Cristian Araya Member of Congress, Chile
- 5. Stephen Nikola Bartulica Member of the European Parliament
- 6. Stephen Baskerville, PhD Professor of Political Studies, Collegium Intermarium, Warsaw
- 7. Ludek Bednar Publicist and Ex-Dissident of the Communist Regime
- 8. Sabine Beppler-Spahl Chair Freiblickinstitut e.V.
- 9. Hedwig v. Beverfoerde Spokeswoman of DemoFürAlle
- 10. Laoise de Brún BL CEO & Founder, The Countess
- 11. Dr. Peter Boghossian Founding Faculty Advisor, University of Austin
- 12. Eduardo Bolsonaro Member of Congress, Brazil
- Sam Brownback Former US Senator, Former US Ambassador-At-Large for International Religious Freedom
- 14. Ivo Budil Professor of Anthropology and University Teacher

- 15. Javier Villamor Cantera Journalist
- 16. Paul Coleman Executive Director, ADF International
- 17. Leonardo Correa Lawyer, 3C Law, Brazil
- 18. Rodrigo Iván Cortés Former Member of Congress, Brazil
- 19. Ivan David Member of the European Parliament
- 20. Seth Dillon CEO, The Babylon Bee
- 21. Mihaela Djorgova Psychologist, Chairman and Co-Founder of the Association Society and Values, Bulgaria
- 22. Misa Djurkovic, PhD Head of the Center of Geopolitics, MCC Budapest and Researcher, Institute of European Studies, Belgrade
- 23. Katerina Dostalova Art Gallery Owner
- 24. Klara Dostalova Member of the European Parliament
- 25. Rod Dreher Author and Journalist
- 26. Petr Drulak Professor of Politology and Former Czech Ambassador
- 27. Chris Elston "Billboard Chris" Child Protection Advocate, Free Speech Activist
- 28. Ellen Kryger Fantini Online Editor, The European Conservative
- 29. Ján Figel' President FOREF Europe, Slovakia, Former European Commissioner
- 30. Paulo Figueiredo Journalist, USA/Brazil
- 31. Angeline Furet Member of the European Parliament
- 32. Elio A. Gallego García Chair of Philosophy of Law at San Pablo CEU University and Founding Member of the Spanish Law & Liberty Circle
- 33. Robert P. George, JD, DPhil, DCL, DLitt McCormick Professor of Jurisprudence, Princeton University
- 34. Asterios Thomas Girbas Attorney at Law, PhD candidate, University of Athens, Greece
- 35. Jan Gregor Vice-Chairman, Alliance for Family, Czech Republic
- 36. Branko Grims Member of the European Parliament
- 37. Wayne Grudem, PhD Distinguished Research Professor Emeritus of Theology and Biblical Studies, Phoenix Seminary, USA
- 38. Brice Hamard Lawyer and Civil Society Leader
- 39. Kaspars Herbsts Member of the Board of Association "Gimene", Latvia
- 40. Patrick-André de Hillerin Journalist
- 41. Prof. Dr. Ralf Höcker LL.M. Attorney-at-law, Cologne, Germany
- 42. Andrea Hoffman Lawyer, Instituto Isabel, Brazil
- 43. James Holland European Parliament Advisor
- 44. Zdenek Hraba Senator, Czech Republic
- 45. Ginka Hrisova Founder of the International Legal Advice Center (ILAC)
- 46. Ladislav Ilčić Former Member of the European Parliament
- 47. Ladislav Jakl Former Secretary of the Czech President Václav Klaus
- 48. Jean-Marc Potdevin Member of Esperalgo and the Former VP of Yahoo Europe
- 49. Cecilie Jilkova Writer, Daughter of Czechoslovak Dissidents
- 50. Virginie Joron Member of the European Parliament
- 51. Fernand Kartheiser Member of the European Parliament

- 52. Daniel Kaiser Echo Weekly Columnist
- 53. Birgit Kelle Journalist and Bestselling Author, Germany
- 54. Dr. Michael Kinsella Director, Digital Justice Institute
- 55. Viktor Kostov, PhD Lawyer, and Missiologist, Freedom for All
- 56. Ondrej Knotek Member of the European Parliament
- 57. Kyriakos Kotsoglu Associate Professor, School of Law, Northumbria University Research Fellow
- 58. Daniela Kovářová Senator, Czech Republic
- 59. Dr. Gudrun Kugler Member of Parliament, Austria
- 60. Madeleine Lacsko Journalist and Writer, Brazil
- 61. Agustín Laje Author and Political Scientist
- 62. Jan Ledóchowski President of Platform Christdemokratie
- 63. Alix Lejard EU Delegate, Femina Europe
- 64. Dr. Norman Lewis Visiting Research Fellow, MCC Brussels
- 65. Dr. James Lindsay President of New Discourses
- 66. Stéphane Luçon Journalist, DSA Article 53 Complainant
- 67. Paul Marshall Baylor University, Hudson Institute, Religious Freedom Institute
- 68. Dr. Javier Martínez-Torrón Professor of Law, Complutense University, Madrid, Spain
- 69. Pavel Matocha Member of the Czech Television Council
- 70. Ann E. Mayer Associate Professor Emeritus of Legal Studies, The Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania
- 71. Alan Miller Together Association
- 72. Dr. Calum Miller Medical Doctor, Research Fellow, University of Oxford
- 73. Saloméja Fernandez Montojo Assistant Professor of Mykolas Romeris University, Lithuania
- 74. Dra. María Jesús Gutiérrez del Moral Professora Titular Acreditada Catedràtica, Degana de la Facultat de Dret / Dean Faculty of Law, Universitat de Girona
- 75. Michaela Moravčíková Faculty of Law, Trnava University, Slovakia
- 76. Carol Nolan Member of Parliament, Ireland
- 77. Brendan O'Neill Chief Political Writer, Spiked
- 78. Sarah O'Reilly CEO, Free Speech Ireland
- 79. Rafael Palomino Professor of Law, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, Spain
- 80. Sylvie Perez French Author
- 81. Andrea Piccioti-Bayer Director, The Conscience Project
- 82. Margarita de la Pisa Member of the European Parliament
- 83. Jaroslava Pokorná Jermanová Member of the European Parliament
- 84. Laetitia Watteau Pouliquen Advocacy Director at NBIC Ethics
- 85. Gabriel Quadri Member of Parliament, Mexico
- 86. Dr. Aaron Rhodes Author, Former Executive Director of the International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights, and Former President of the Forum for Religious Freedom-Europe

- 87. Prof. Etienne de Rocquigny Chairman, Espérance & Algorithmes Think-tank, Founder, Blaise Pascal Advisors
- 88. Patricia Santos Rodríguez Editor in Brussels for El Debate, Professor of Philosophy of Law, University CEU San Pablo Madrid, Spain
- 89. Robert Roos Former Member of the European Parliament
- 90. John Rosenthal Independent Scholar and Journalist
- 91. Pedro Tenorio Sanchez Catedrático de Derecho Constitucional
- 92. Henk Jan van Schothorst Executive Director CCI
- 93. Maimon Schwarzschild Professor of Law, University of San Diego
- 94. Michael Shellenberger CBB Chair of Censorship, Politics, & Free Speech at the University of Austin & Founder, Civilization Works. Twitter Files
- 95. HyoSung Shin Visiting Professor, PhD in Law, Department of Law and Public Administration, Myongji University
- 96. John Theodore Steenhof Principal Lawyer, Human Rights Law Alliance Limited, Australia
- 97. Joachim Nikolaus Steinhöfel Attorney and Bestselling Author
- 98. Karolina Stonjekova Political Columnist
- 99. Nadine Strossen Senior Fellow, FIRE, Former President, American Civil Liberties Union (1991-2008)
- 100. David Thunder Ramón y Cajal Researcher, Institute for Culture & Society, Religion & Civil Society Project, Biblioteca de Humanidades, University of Navarra
- 101. Laurence Trochu Member of the European Parliament
- 102. Carl R. Trueman Fellow at the Ethics and Public Policy Center, Washington, D.C.
- 103. George Tryfiates Vice President for Public Policy and Legal Affairs, Association of Christian Schools International
- 104. Filip Turek Member of the European Parliament
- 105. David Vandeput President of Voorzitter, General Secretary of the Federal Synod of Protestant and Evangelical Churches in Belgium
- 106. Daniel Vavra Free Speech Society Co-Founder
- 107. Vlastimil Vesely Director, The Free Speech Society, Czech Republic
- 108. Kristen Waggoner President & CEO, Alliance Defending Freedom / ADF International
- 109. Godfrey Yogarajah General Secretary, National Christian Evangelical Alliance of Sri Lanka and Ambassador for Religious Freedom, World Evangelical Alliance
- 110. Lord Toby Young Founder & General Secretary, Free Speech Union
- 111. Sergio Zaragoza México Elige, Mexico